

SPWLA - *PETROPHYSICS*

Manuscript Technical Review/Evaluation Form

This form is designed to summarize the manuscript review that you have completed and to ensure that you have considered all appropriate criteria in your review. Answers to these questions will be used by the Editor and Associate Editors in making the final decision on publication. Your review should provide a clear statement, to the authors and editors, of the modifications necessary before the paper can be published or the specific reasons for rejection. Please complete all parts. ***Please provide amplification and clarifications for your "no" responses.***

Additional comments and explanations on attached sheets are encouraged!

Author(s):

Title:

Main technical point of the paper

ANONYMITY:

If you wish your identity revealed to the author please use the space below:

Reviewer's name:

Address:

Telephone/Fax:

email:

PUBLICATION DECISION:

___ **ACCEPT** This paper should be published in *Petrophysics* after minor revision. Changes noted below are designed to help the author revise the paper for publication.

___ **REVISE AND RESUBMIT** The major revisions noted below must be incorporated in a revised version which must be submitted for further review before a decision on publication can be made.

___ **REJECT** The paper is unacceptable for publication in *Petrophysics* for the reason stated below.

RECOMMENDED PUBLICATION FORMAT:

___ **Article** (complete and detailed discussion of the topic - should satisfy C on page 2)

___ **Technical Note** (brief description of logging methods or interpretation techniques)

___ **Other (e.g. Computer Note, Business Note, Field example, Le Log column, etc.**

- please describe)

EVALUATION:

A. *Previous Publication*

YES NO

___ ___ Has any part of this manuscript been published previously or is it part of another paper?

If yes, please explain: _____

___ ___ In a refereed journal?

___ ___ In SPWLA or CWLS meeting proceedings or transactions or other society meeting? If so, where?

B. *Originality (Required for a full article - good in a Note)*

___ ___ Does this manuscript contain new and original principles, concepts, or methods or applications?

___ ___ Does the paper contain a solution to a new problem or a new and improved solution to an existing problem (e.g., theory or modeling)?

___ ___ Does this manuscript describe an important aspect of log analysis, log interpretation, or petrophysics, in an original way (e.g., case study/log interpretation)?

___ ___ Does this paper describe either a new method of doing old work or a method of doing something new (e.g., laboratory work)?

___ ___ Are new insights provided for the subject reviewed (e.g., review paper)?

___ ___ Does this manuscript report significant new data?

___ ___ Does this paper avoid undue promotion of a commercial product?

(Circle appropriate area)

High

Low

Significance of contribution

X X X X X X X X X X

Originality of material presented

X X X X X X X X X X

C. *General* (Check appropriate box and provide explanations below)

	No Desirable Change	Minor Revision Helpful	Minor Revision Required	Major Revision Helpful	Major Revision Required
Technical accuracy					
Validity of conclusions					
Organization					
Clarity of expression					
Abstract (articles only)					
Total Length					
Illustrations (number)					
Illustrations (clarity)					
Mathematics (accuracy)					
Mathematics (clarity)					
References (accurately cited)					
Discussion of usefulness or applicability					
Overall evaluation					

D. *Practicality or "how-to"* (Good for papers - required for Technical Notes etc.)

YES NO

- ___ ___ Does this submission illustrate a useful technology?
- ___ ___ Does this submission help in use of computers?
- ___ ___ Does this submission offer project management techniques?
- ___ ___ Would an average petrophysicist find this useful?
- ___ ___ Does this submission provide significant field data?
- ___ ___ Does this paper avoid undue promotion of a commercial product?

(Circle appropriate area) High Low

Degree of practical use X X X X X X X X X X

E. *Other Comments* (attach additional sheets if desired)